

NATIONAL IDENTITY IN TRANSNATIONAL LIFE: THE CASE OF DUAL EDUCATION OF INDONESIAN MIGRANT CHILDREN IN SABAH, EAST MALAYSIA

Arif Saefudin^{1*}, Jumintono² and Rejokirono³

¹Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, Universitas PGRI Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

²Faculty of Technical and Vocational Education, Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia, Johor, Malaysia

³Directorate of Postgraduate Education, Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

*Corresponding author: arifsae@upy.ac.id

Published online: 30 April 2024

To cite this article: Arif Saefudin, Jumintono and Rejokirono. 2024. National identity in transnational life: The case of dual education of Indonesian migrant children in Sabah, east Malaysia. *Kajian Malaysia* 42(1): 117–138. <https://doi.org/10.21315/km2024.42.1.6>

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.21315/km2024.42.1.6>

ABSTRACT

Everyone everywhere has the right to education, including migrant children living transnational lives. The practice of transnational life in dual education for Indonesian migrant children is the main focus of this research. As such, this article examines the extent of recruitment, learning processes, outcomes and looks at the different perceptions between two educational institutions: Community Learning Centre Indonesia (CLCI) and Humana Child Aid Society Sabah (HCASS). The research method used was phenomenological qualitative, focusing on Terusan 2 Estate and Sapi 2 Estate, Sandakan District, Sabah, East Malaysia. Interviews were conducted with 25 respondents comprising teachers, students and policymakers of migrant children's education in Sabah. Observation and documentary analysis were also conducted to strengthen the research. The research findings show prominent differences between the CLCI and HCASS education systems regarding recruitment, processes and learning outcomes. In addition, the findings also explored transnational life practices in education with two different systems. This is because one student subject received very different learning curriculum systems: Indonesia and Malaysia. Students, unconsciously or consciously, practice "code-switching" behaviour in their interactions with

their environment. However, support from the Indonesian government offers some level of national identity inculcation for students in transnational life. In addition, support from the Malaysian government and the oil palm plantations company made the teaching practice run conductively with good facilities and respectful solidarity based on universal peace. Implementing the right to education means providing equal opportunities for all migrant children to access and thrive in higher-quality schools so that, in the future, they can contribute to international life.

Keywords: dual education, Indonesian migrant children, national identity, oil palm plantations, transnational life

INTRODUCTION

Internationally, the education issue for children of migrant workers is an important topic and, in some cases, determines bilateral relations between countries. Education is a fundamental right of human life everywhere. This commitment is contained in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights Article 26, Point 1: “Everyone has the right to education. Education shall be free, at least in the elementary and fundamental stages. Elementary education shall be compulsory” (United Nations 2015, 54). This declaration emphasises providing access to basic education for all children, including migrant children living transnational lives around the world.

Access to education for migrant children is also important in the bilateral relationship between Indonesia and Malaysia. This topic has been an important discussion on the “tolerant” relationship between the two countries (Clark and Pietsch 2014). Indonesia and Malaysia are neighbouring countries with a geographical border, allowing Indonesians migrate to Malaysia. International Organisation for Migration Indonesia estimates that Indonesian workers constitute 1,215,000 out of 1,849,600 migrant workers in Malaysia, and the figure does not even include the undocumented (Baltazar, Abubakar and Hassan 2019). One region in Malaysia that has become a “favourite” place for migration is the region of Sabah, East Malaysia. In Malaysia, Sabah hosts the most significant number of non-Malaysian migrant workers (Lasimbang, Tong and Low 2016). They mostly live in oil palm plantation sites in the districts of Sandakan and Tawau, with migrants predominantly from Indonesia and the Philippines (Allerton 2020). Migrant workers from Indonesia consist of officially documented migrant workers and undocumented migrant workers who are not recorded in the data centres (in Malaysia and Indonesia) with certainty (Abdul Hamid, Norlida Hanim and Zulkifli 2015). Migrant workers engage in transnational interactions that cross the

boundaries of time, space and culture (Norhayati and Nursakirah 2022). These interactions pose several problems, especially for the children of migrant workers who need access to education to strengthen their national identity. National identity issues relate to people living in their own country and other countries where they live and work (Puder 2019). These children fall into two categories: those under 18 brought from Indonesia to Sabah and those who were born and grew up in Sabah; both violate Malaysian regulations (Low 2017). In a 2019 report, a conservative estimate by the Federal Task Force on Sabah and Labuan noted that 30,000 children were born to undocumented parents (Baltazar, Abubakar and Hassan 2019).

Transnational children who live with their parents as migrant workers are vulnerable to national identity bias (Paschero and McBrien 2021). The notion of national identity refers to the interconnectedness of national connections to the borderless global, where people can understand themselves with others most closely (Byrne 2018). This phenomenon also happens to migrant children in Sabah. They experience a unique transnational life, gaining access to dual education provided by two educational institutions: first, the Community Learning Centre Indonesia (CLCI) from the Indonesian government, and second, Humana Child Aid Society Sabah (HCASS), from a Malaysian non-governmental organisation (NGO). Therefore, this article aims to look at the practice of dual education for children of migrant workers, starting from the planning, learning process and outcomes, and analysing the differences in perceptions between the two educational institutions.

Education of Indonesian Migrant Children in Malaysia

There has been much research on education for migrant children. Previous research shows that migrant children's education in other countries experiences many barriers and problems (Aarsaether 2021; Boldermo and Ødegaard 2019; Devine 2013; Dong 2020; Gromova et al. 2021; Heldal et al. 2021; Oliveira 2020; Stefoni and Corvalán 2019; Wierna 2021). In many other parts of the world, migrant children are discriminated against (Juang and Schachner 2020; Nygård 2021; Wierna 2021). Educational discrimination is still considered a sensitive issue, and many countries do not have the right formula to address it. Indonesia and Malaysia also experience this problem as geographically bordering countries. The problem starts when Indonesians migrate to Malaysia to work without valid documents, most of whom bring their children or have them born in Malaysia. A large number of such migrants have one striking attribute, which is their irregular status in the host country, and therefore, the lack of protection of their basic rights from both the source and host countries (Razali, Tamara and Duraisingam 2015), one of which is their basic education rights.

From the Malaysian government's perspective, education policy only provides access to children who are truly Malaysian citizens with the Malaysian Education Blueprint 2013–2025 plan (Ahmad Fauzi and Mohd Hariszuan 2018). However, it is still in the Malaysian government's interest to comply with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, especially after the Convention on the Rights of the Child in 1989. Therefore, since 1991, the HCASS has been established as an NGO that provides access to education for all migrant children in Sabah. The founders were Torben Venning, a Danish anthropologist, and his Filipino Muslim wife, who started three HCASS centres in Lahad Datu (Lumayag 2016). These educational institutions became local communities that were "recognised as enclaves of privilege" (Liew 2019). In Malaysia, children under 18 are still categorised as children who must receive basic education (Lydia et al. 2018). As of 2018, HCASS has assisted in educating 14,199 migrant workers' children. HCASS provides access to basic education for undocumented children, especially those living in oil palm plantations, although there are also children from the manufacturing and construction sectors. HCASS has 439 teachers and 128 HCASS centres across Sabah (Humana 2018).

From an Indonesian perspective, the issue of migrant children in Malaysia is a serious problem. The 1945 Constitution, Article 31, emphasises that "every citizen shall have the right to education, and the government shall provide for it." This obligation covers all Indonesians wherever they are, including in the Sabah region (Rahimah and Suriati 2013). However, Indonesia's efforts to provide access to education have been a long process. It was not until the Annual Consultation in 2006 that the governments of Indonesia and Malaysia reached an agreement to establish Sekolah Indonesia Kota Kinabalu (SIKK). SIKK later became the CLCI's central institution in the Sabah region, with 45,000 migrant workers of school age (Diliawan and Rahayu 2018). From this agreement, the Indonesian government began sending teachers to Sabah to teach migrant children directly in the oil palm plantations. As it did not have a school, the Indonesian government collaborated with HCASS to share a standard school classroom (Lumayag 2016). From 2006 to 2020, the Indonesian government continued to send teachers in collaboration with HCASS and palm oil companies as learning centres.

Furthermore, both CLCI and HCASS cooperate in educating migrant children in oil palm plantations with different policies, which each party considers "the best education" for the child's future. However, despite this, many studies show various problems with education policies for migrant children. Teacher shortages and limited facilities are a problem in the learning process (Dong 2020; Gromova et al. 2021; Juang and Schachner 2020). Furthermore, issues arise about communication

in transnational life and the cultivation of national identity in schools. Devine (2013, 282) says:

Identity for migrant labour children considers the dilemmas around “values” and “assessment” in schools. There is a tension in pedagogic practice between the judgement of migrant children and their “value added” in school. Its limitations involve reproducing negative patterns in a dialectical circle under the achievements of migrant children and other children at risk of deficiencies in culture and identity.

Over the decades, the issue of migrant children’s education in Sabah has continued to grow. Although there are many problems in the education process of migrant children, it does not prevent CLCI and HCASS from providing access to education. CLCI and HCASS continue to provide access to education for school-age children in oil palm plantations, but despite their contributions, there is still an influx of undocumented school-age children into Sabah (Cheong 2022). It is feared that this will turn migrant children into at-risk youth in their transnational lives.

Theoretical Perspective

This research adopts the ideas of Henri Tajfel and John Turner’s social identity theory. Social identity theory explains that all people are part of social group members, whether they are large groups, such as political affiliations, cultures, countries or smaller groups, such as family neighbourhoods, peers, or schools, where membership is obtained from small neighbourhoods (Tajfel and Turner 1979; 2004; Turner 1975). An individual’s membership in a group will make the group’s norms guide the rules of its members so that they agree and follow the norms in the group. This reference group provides its members with an “identification” (Parker 2014; Tajfel and Turner 2004), where an individual is allowed to change from personal identity to social identity called “in-group” and from in-group interacting with “out-group” (Mangum and Block 2018; Tajfel and Turner 1979). This social identity can have either positive or negative effects. Of course, an individual strives for a positive social identity to increase self-esteem (Trepte and Loy 2017), even if one is living a transnational life. Transnational life patterns among migrants take many forms in social, cultural, economic and political arenas. Furthermore, each form can be “broad” or “narrow” and can vary over time, depending on the intensity of exchange and communication (Pouliou and Jarec 2021; Vertovec 2001).

In the case of migrant workers, they consciously sometimes cross hostile transnational boundaries (Andreouli and Howarth 2013) and struggle to find a sense of kinship with the group in the overseas land (Lee 2020). In the process of this

transnational life, they then give birth to undocumented children in contravention of the host country's regulations (Allerton 2020). In this context, children of migrant workers will take reference from their immediate social environment since childhood, and these interactions will determine their national identity later in life (Tirado and Del Olmo 2019; Turner 1975). These children may become at-risk youth with limited educational opportunities. Those who experience identity confusion risk presenting conflicts to other neighbourhood groups that can escalate (Borden 2016; Mangum and Block 2018). This is because social identity tends to compare the differentiating value of the in-group with the out-group so that individuals will consider their group better than other groups (Tajfel and Turner 1979). There is a need for intervention from the larger group (the country) to solve this problem so that they can be empowered to become productive citizens of their nation in the future and become ambassadors for the country they live in transnational life (Wong and Ghazali 2020; Nesadurai 2019; Vertovec 2001). By providing access to education, which teaches universal values of nationalism and peace between countries, the potential for widespread social conflict can be anticipated.

Social identity theory provides a useful understanding of the identity formation process of migrant worker children in receiving access to education. So that they will make their country group a reference for their identity to make an individual commitment to their country stronger; this can be an incentive identification in forming a commitment, integrity and cohesiveness of the group as well as taking characteristics to generate positive feelings towards the in-group (in-group favouritism) and avoid out-group derogation (Ha and Jang 2015; Tajfel and Turner 2004). To avoid these attitudes, in transnational life, some migrants engage in "code-switching", which is the process of a person switching between two or more languages in a single interaction and can occur consciously or unconsciously, depending on the situation and communication needs involved. Code-switching can be useful for communicating with others from different cultural backgrounds (Norhayati and Nursakirah 2022). In some of these definitions, the researcher defines national identity as the behaviour of instilling Indonesian national identity values in children of migrant workers in oil palm plantation schools and being open to transnational life and code-switching behaviour.

METHODOLOGY

This research uses the phenomenological paradigm's qualitative approach (Williams 2021). Traditionally, qualitative data collection uses observation, interviews and document analysis (Denzin and Lincoln 2018). This study aims to explain the

selection system, learning process, outcomes and different perceptions of the dual access to education received by children of migrant workers. Two educational institutions provide access to education: CLCI by the Indonesian government and HCASS, a Malaysian NGO. This research was conducted at schools in Terusan 2 Estate and Sapi 2 Estate, operated by Wilmar Plantation Company in Jalan Sapi Nangoh, Sandakan District, Sabah, East Malaysia. The data collection method was carried out by direct observation at the research location for one month in February 2020. This is because the phenomenon felt by everyone can be an interesting and distinctive object of scientific study (Neubauer, Witkop and Varpio 2019). In-depth interviews were conducted with 25 informants as the primary research data source. As a breakdown, there were interviews with 18 students with dual educational access. They consisted of 9 students from CLCI Terusan 2 or HCASS 132 Terusan 2, and 9 from CLCI Sapi 2 or HCASS 136 Sapi 2. Finally, documents found during the research process regularly contributed to making “meaningful sense” of all components of the research data (Denzin and Lincoln 2018).

In addition to the 18 students, data was sought from additional informants, namely two teachers from Indonesia who were assigned to CLCI, and two local teachers from Malaysia who were teachers at HCASS. The teachers were chosen because they are the policy and curriculum implementers. In addition, one staff member of the Consulate General of the Republic of Indonesia, Kota Kinabalu, is considered a representative of the Indonesian government in making Indonesian education policies in Sabah. The data was complemented with an interview with one coordinator from HCASS for the Sandakan District area. Other supporting data was taken from one informant from the Terusan 2 Estate official. The 25 informants from different backgrounds made this research balanced and comprehensive. They are considered implementers and policymakers in educating Indonesian migrant children in Sabah. The informants were selected by purposive sampling, consisting of those directly involved in the field. The analysis model uses deductive and inductive themes according to the framework without forcing data that does not fit into the appropriate category. This method was chosen to determine emerging categories based on the specified research objectives (Flemming and Noyes 2021; Neubauer, Witkop and Varpio 2019). Due to ethical considerations, informants’ names were concealed, thus protecting their privacy (Table 1).

Table 1: Details of participants, gender, position and nationality

Participants	Gender	Position	Nationality
P1	Male	Student	Indonesia
P2	Male	Student	Indonesia
P3	Male	Student	Indonesia
P4	Male	Student	Indonesia
P5	Male	Student	Indonesia
P6	Female	Student	Indonesia
P7	Female	Student	Indonesia
P8	Female	Student	Indonesia
P9	Female	Student	Indonesia
P10	Male	Student	Indonesia
P11	Male	Student	Indonesia
P12	Male	Student	Indonesia
P13	Male	Student	Indonesia
P14	Female	Student	Indonesia
P15	Female	Student	Indonesia
P16	Female	Student	Indonesia
P17	Female	Student	Indonesia
P18	Female	Student	Indonesia
P19	Male	Consulate official	Indonesia
P20	Male	Plantation manager	Malaysia
P21	Female	HCASS teacher	Malaysia
P22	Female	HCASS teacher	Malaysia
P23	Male	CLCI teacher	Indonesia
P24	Female	CLCI teacher	Indonesia
P25	Male	HCASS coordinator	Malaysia

The study is unique in focusing on the rare practice of dual education for migrant children in Sabah. Furthermore, the informants selected are implementers and policymakers of education in oil palm plantations, both from CLCI and HCASS. Researchers also observed teaching practices directly at Terusan 2 Estate and Sapi 2 Estate for one month (February 2020) so that data accuracy was ascertained through observation, interviews and documentary analysis in more detail and comprehensively. However, some limitations in the research also need to be mentioned. Firstly, the determination of Indonesia's education policy is complex, especially overseas policies that require cooperation between the two countries. For this reason, the Malaysian perspective has not been exposed in this research study, especially in examining access to education by HCASS in depth. Secondly, Indonesian education policies in Malaysia for migrant workers' children are exist

not only in Sabah; there are also Indonesian schools in Sarawak and Peninsular Malaysia that have not been widely researched in the study of education services. Time constraints and the vastness of the Sabah region are obstacles to studying access to education more broadly; the vastness of the Sabah region makes education cases different. For this reason, future researchers can take this position as education studies researchers from Indonesia and Malaysia.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

CLCI and HCASS Student Recruitment System

The behaviour of the recruitment system to become a student at CLCI and HCASS was the first topic raised by the participants. The student recruitment system at CLCI is based on documents proving one's Indonesian citizenship (e.g., interviews P1 to P18). P9 said in full:

I was told to collect documents such as a birth certificate (*akta kelahiran*), family card (*kartu keluarga*), or anything that proved I was from Indonesia. If I did not have any documents, there had to be documents proving that my parents were from Indonesia.

The requirements for student recruitment at CLCI Terusan 2 and Sapi 2 are almost identical, as they come from one recruitment system (interview P23). In the field, the requirements to become a CLCI student are not too burdensome as long as they show one of the documents that prove the student is from Indonesia. With this document proving them to be from Indonesia, it becomes the main requirement to become a CLCI student. In addition to the documents provided, teachers also coordinate with the company to collect data on school children. P23 said, "For CLCI education, we are allowed by the manager to access education as long as we do not violate the existing rules." The recruitment system in CLCI is different from that of HCASS. In HCASS, student recruitment does not look at the country of origin or document status (e.g., P21). P22 explained student recruitment at HCASS:

All children whose parents work on plantations are potential HCASS students. There are no documents that I ask for; the children's documents come from the company's data. We do not see which nationality the prospective students come from, but the parents must work in the company. For example, if I teach at HCASS Terusan 2 Estate under Wilmar Group Plantation, I collect school-age children in the entire Terusan 2 Estate area.

Prospective HCASS students are not required to have documents; HCASS teachers are only guided by company data of workers who have children of compulsory school age. Even the students come from several different countries; as P22 said, “We accept students wherever they come from [who are from Wilmar Group Plantation], most are from Indonesia, and the second is from the Philippines because all of them are required to go to school.” P20 confirms the obligation to provide access to education in the company:

Every palm oil company is obliged to organise education services for the children of their workers; we have CSR (Corporate Social Responsibility) funds to support all education facilities. If you want your palm oil products to be recognised by the RSPO (Roundtable On Sustainable Palm Oil), some principles must be met in the production process and use palm oil. One of the principles is to organise education for the children of workers.

The recruitment of students to provide access to education in different systems and ways. This is also supported by the company that oversees it. The company provides all school facilities, such as payroll, classrooms and all facilities. The results of researcher observations on 10 February 2020 showed that the school’s classrooms in Terusan 2 Estate and Sapi 2 Estate are decent because they are filled with facilities, such as blackboards, fans, chairs, and even gardens filled with flowers. Therefore, it can be said that the classrooms and facilities at both estates are suitable for carrying out the education process. Although migrant children lead transnational lives, student recruitment in Sandakan is structured, in contrast to immigrant student recruitment in research in Russia (Gromova et al. 2021), Italy (Biasutti and Concina 2021), Argentina (Wierna 2021) and, Brazil (Oliveira 2020), which requires full initiation from teachers. Student recruitment at CLCI and HCASS is already subject to agreement and cooperation between the two institutions without having to compete for prospective students. Cooperation between educational institutions and the management of oil palm plantation companies is an obligation in the field. The recruitment of students to access education has a bearing on the diplomatic relations between Indonesia and Malaysia (Lee 2020). This diplomatic relationship allows undocumented children to be granted access to return to Indonesia or work in Sabah with official documents (Allerton 2020; Loganathan et al. 2022). It is also to thoroughly prevent the use of child labour in the interest of effective policy interventions and business actions (Andika and Ramli 2022).

Learning Process at CLCI and HCASS

P1 to P18 are school-age students who study at HCASS in the morning and at CLCI in the afternoon. However, the learning systems used by CLCI and HCASS have significant differences. The learning system at CLCI is conducted during the day. P1 to P18 agreed to say, “We study every Monday to Friday from 1:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m.” In observation, lessons are not only during the designated hours, but students often take the time to hold additional lessons at the teacher’s house. HCASS uses yellow-green colours for school uniforms, while CLCI uses white-blue uniforms. The system used at CLCI adopts the curriculum implemented in Indonesia. P23 and P24 gave almost the same explanation about learning at CLCI; the full explanation is given by P23:

The learning system conducted at CLCI 100% uses the Indonesian curriculum system, which starts in July every year. Even textbooks, and school uniforms, are sent from Indonesia. The language of instruction must use Indonesian. This is to introduce Indonesian identity as well as the main thing. Outside class hours, I usually organise a group approach by bringing students to my house.

The primary task of Indonesian teachers is to introduce national identity to the children of migrant workers. According to P23, this is a top priority because the inculcation of national identity is done (according to Indonesian government policy) to introduce the values of nationalism. P23 and P24 are also required to maintain the priority of introducing the Indonesian national identity. Therefore, the use of the Indonesian language in learning is mandatory; P24 said,

Many students use Bugis dialect or Malay language (Sabahan dialect) in learning. Therefore, I have to teach and familiarise them with the correct Indonesian language. But after learning, students can mingle with the community using their Bugis dialect or Sabahan dialect.

The flagship programme of CLCI is to conduct an annual event which is always conducted to bring out the talents and interests of students, namely the Appreciation and Creation of Academic, Sports and Arts (Apresiasi dan Kreasi Akademik, Olahraga dan Seni [APKRES]). Representatives from all CLCIs in Sabah attend the competition. P24 said:

The students will represent their respective branches of the competition. They are enthusiastic about this event because they will be invited to Kota Kinabalu. In Sabah, the CLCI central is at Sekolah Indonesia Kota Kinabalu (SIKK). For them, being able to go to SIKK is a rare moment. Usually, they are afraid to leave their homes; with permission from the

Arif Saefudin et al.

Consulate, the students can go to SIKK without fear of being arrested by the police.

Apart from APKRES as the most awaited moment (e.g., by P1, P3, P4, P8, P9, P11, P12, P13, P18), there is also Indonesian Children's Jamboree in Malaysia (Jambore Anak Indonesia di Malaysia [JAIM]), as another big event that is most popular (e.g., by P1, P2, P4, P7, P8, P10, P14, P15, P16, P17, P18). This scouting jamboree also includes all CLCI representatives in Sabah. The difference is that SIKK organises APKRES, but JAIM is sponsored by the Consulate General of Kota Kinabalu (interviews P23 and P24). Both events are utilised to further instil the values of nationalism and national identity with various activities.

In contrast to CLCI, HCASS adopts the Malaysian curriculum, including the language of instruction using Malay (e.g., P1 to P18). This is in accordance with P22's opinion:

The curriculum we use is the Malaysian curriculum. The start of the curriculum is in January every year, and there are 5 subjects taught, namely maths, science, Malay language, English and religion. Learning is done for 5 days, from Monday to Friday at 7:30 a.m. to 11:00 a.m.

The learning system at HCASS was also commented on by P21:

We follow the system of the country we live in, Malaysia. Because many of our students come from different countries, most are from Indonesia, second from the Philippines, Malaysia and stateless. We consider education should remain neutral regardless of background, nationality and legal status.

For P22, "All children who cannot access education in Malaysian national schools have the same right to basic education in HCASS." The main mission of HCASS is also confirmed by the opinion of P25, "HCASS has a mission to reduce child labour in the oil palm plantation sector. Thus, HCASS provides education for migrant children to hone their basic education knowledge and further development with sports and arts programmes."

In addition to teaching, Indonesian teachers are also ambassadors of the consulate general of the Republic of Indonesia to take care of undocumented children, as also found by Rahimah and Suriati (2013), Lumayag (2016) and Loganathan et al. (2022). Teachers have an interest and duty given by the government for migrant workers' children, which is to instil national identity (Andreouli and Howarth 2013; Breton 2015; Ha and Jang 2015; Oliveira 2020; Schahbasi, Huber and Fieder 2021)

by teaching culture, history and getting used to speaking Indonesian. Limited hours are a reason to organise individual approaches to help students improve academic and non-academic performance. This is similar to research in Russia without a centralised transitional practice model (Gromova et al. 2021). Providing extra hours outside the classroom, especially for migrant children, effectively introduces their national identity. Although, in other studies, this method has a disadvantage, which makes performance ability low (Biasutti, Concina and Frate 2020). Keeping track of students' achievements and instilling national identity at the same time can make students' hopes of continuing their studies in Indonesia higher.

On the other hand, HCASS uses Malaysian systems and curriculum in the learning process. HCASS provides an alternative and participatory approach to development in Malaysia. The system relies on collaboration between the Malaysian and Indonesian governments and NGOs. As previous research has shown (Amir Shah 2019; Farouk and Husin 2015; Ibrahim and Alagidede 2020; Saqib et al. 2015; Shiohata 2012), the purpose of the HCASS is to support the outcomes of achieving universal equality. The funding of HCASS comes from corporate social responsibility (CSR) funds from palm oil companies and funding from other donors (Humana 2018). CSR facilities from palm oil companies are used to support education services. Companies that support children's right to basic education have high credibility in the eyes of the Roundtable and Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO). HCASS was born due to various complex social problems in providing alternative and participatory approaches to development (Farouk and Husin 2015). HCASS also invests time in the school's classrooms and has good relations with the Malaysian and Indonesian governments (CLCI).

During learning at HCASS, students use Malay (Sabahan dialect) as a second language. This points to the fact that HCASS teachers develop specialised teaching methods to teach Malay. Students unknowingly practise "code-switching" in their transnational interactions, i.e., switching between two or more languages in one conversation. Students do this to express solidarity with a particular group. Code-switching behaviour occurs naturally in multilingual communities and is often used as a tool for communication and expression. It is not necessarily a sign of language proficiency or language impairment but rather a reflection of the complexity and diversity of language use in multilingual contexts (Norhayati and Nursakirah 2022). HCASS considers that learning about transnational life needs to be taught with a contextualised approach, which introduces the place around it, including all its aspects (Lumayag 2016). These two systems have been approved by the competent authorities in Malaysia and strengthened by the agreement between CLCI and HCASS. These findings imply the consequences of transnational life for children of migrant workers. The system implemented by CLCI provides a useful

understanding of the process of national identity formation. Thus, students will take their country as a reference point for identity and make an individual's commitment to their country stronger, resulting in positive feelings towards their country (in-group favouritism) (Devine 2013; Tajfel and Turner 1979). However, students in transnational life also engage in code-switching behaviour when interacting with HCASS teachers or local communities either consciously or unconsciously. This is a consequence that must be felt as they experience transnational life in Sabah.

Outcomes of CLCI and HCASS

Education in CLCI has the outcome that students who live in oil palm plantations be able to continue their education in Indonesia; P19 states this: "The outcome of the education service for Indonesian children in Sabah is to return them to Indonesia, by continuing their education to a higher level." It is in the interest of the Indonesian government to provide access to education and insights into the importance of education so that Indonesian children have a better future. P23 and P24 agreed:

We encourage children to continue their education in Indonesia with 100% scholarships, even to university. Many CLCI graduates have continued their studies in Indonesia and now (2020) have continued to universities in Indonesia. Some have qualified for scholarships abroad, such as in China.

CLCI teachers can only encourage, not force, students to continue their studies in Indonesia. This is also related to communication with parents to permit them to continue their studies in Indonesia (interview P24). The participating students' impressions about their plans after graduating from CLCI (such as P1, P5, P7, P8, P11, P15, P17, and P18) are that "they will continue their studies in Indonesia." For various reasons, many still have not decided, such as "not getting parental permission" (e.g., P2, P3, P16). Alternatively, "I want to work in Sabah only" (e.g., P4, P6, P9, P13) and "have not decided for sure" (e.g., P10, P12, P14). According to P23, arranging for students to continue to Indonesia is difficult, as legal documents must be prepared in collaboration with relevant Malaysian parties.

At HCASS, the most basic outcome of education is to provide important knowledge for students so that there is no child labour in oil palm plantations. According to P25, "HCASS graduates support the sustainable development launched by the United Nations so that they can contribute to the sustainable development of Malaysia." HCASS's commitment to educating so that all children get a proper education even in limited conditions so that there is no child labour in oil palm

plantations. HCASS provides a graduation certificate explaining that the student graduated from HCASS (interview P21). Regarding school continuation, P22 said, “there is no programme to continue to a higher level in HCASS, only we support programmes from CLCI to encourage students to continue their education in Indonesia.”

The difference can be seen in the learning outcomes of CLCI and HCASS. CLCI aims to introduce national identity and encourage students to continue their studies in Indonesia, even to university. However, there are still many CLCI students who are not willing to continue their education in Indonesia. Meanwhile, HCASS provides knowledge and reduces child labour in oil palm plantations. In the latter case, HCASS provides a certificate of completion, but this is different from Lumayag’s (2016) research, which states that the certificate from HCASS is valid in Indonesia. From interviews, observations and documentary analysis, the HCASS certificate cannot be used to continue to Indonesian schools, so teachers must first enter the students for the primary school equivalent exam (Paket A Programme from Indonesia). Nevertheless, HCASS teachers fully support the programme to continue schooling for HCASS students. In some research cases, students repatriated to Indonesia returned illegally to Malaysia, signalling an international border crossing (Cheong 2022; Loganathan et al. 2022). Cases like these make the problem of undocumented migrant workers difficult to resolve between the governments of Indonesia and Malaysia.

Perception Differences

In transnational life interactions, perceptions inevitably arise, including differences between CLCI and HCASS teachers about students. Differences in perception occurred several times between teachers; in Sapi 2 Estate, for example, there was a time when some students participated in a competition in Kota Kinabalu but did not ask permission from the HCASS teacher; this was the beginning of perception differences between teachers. P25 resolved it with, “if there are competitions or other events, you must ask permission first by sending an official letter. Otherwise, there will be miscommunication.” This difference is slightly resolved if there is good communication between teachers. P19 always directs teachers to “respect the policies and systems that already exist in HCASS.” This agreement has maintained the existence of CLCI and HCASS until now (2020). Although some perceptual differences often occur among teachers, they are always resolved and make the situation conducive again.

Differences in perception can be resolved by both institutions agreeing to a cooperation agreement between leaders. So institutionally, CLCI and HCASS

support and respect each other's policies. Students benefit from learning more about transnational life and the cultures of other countries. However, from the students' side, students often experience unconscious code-switching behaviour in interactions with CLCI teachers. The CLCI teacher requires the use of good and correct Indonesian language, while students often misplace their position in the CLCI classroom. Students cannot distinguish when behaving with CLCI teachers or with HCASS teachers, with the national identity of students who are still in the process of knowing their country (e.g., Biasutti and Concina 2021; Oliveira 2020; Stefoni and Corvalán 2019; Wierna 2021). Children who are born and raised as migrants outside their home country are very vulnerable to experiencing confusion of their national identity. To anticipate this, the CLCI teachers in this study held frequent discussions with migrant children and other students in their homes to reduce tensions, resolve conflicts, and encourage collaboration with parents (Gromova et al. 2021). Thus, we argue that relying on in-country teachers, as the Indonesian government does, is a good practice to help identify vulnerable migrant children with migration backgrounds to the risks and uncertainties of statelessness in Malaysia. This policy from the Indonesian government creates a positive attitude and avoids negative attitudes towards its environment.

Thus, a key finding in this research is the Indonesian government's cultivation of national identity in the midst of a complex transnational life characterised by dual education with very different systems. Although the initial data was analysed deductively based on documents and literature, after observations and interviews as well as an inductive approach, the research team found various practices of cooperation between teachers to incorporate appropriate teaching programs for multiculturally diverse students in the classroom to support students' futures. Support from the Indonesian and Malaysian governments made the teaching practice in the Sandakan neighbourhood conducive with adequate facilities. In addition, inductive analysis led the research team to conclude that parents play a very important role in instilling national identity and the learning component that teachers do in the classroom. These findings suggest that social identity theory is relevant and can be extended for future research. Directly, childhood educational institutions collectively play a role in shaping national identity (Tajfel and Turner 1979). This school environment is used as a reference for its members to "identify", where students are allowed to change from personal identity to social identity (in-group), which interacts with the "out-group" (Parker 2014; Turner 1975).

Cooperation in accessing dual education in Sabah is crucial to the future of migrant children living transnational lives. From school facilities and recruitment systems, learning processes and outcomes are structured; although there are some differences in perception, these problems can still be overcome. The phenomenon

in Sabah does not occur in several other countries that run the education process in refugee camps as is the case with several other studies on migrant children in Europe and South America (e.g., Aarsaether 2021; Boldermo and Ødegaard 2019; Devine 2013; Dong 2020; Gromova et al. 2021; Haldal et al. 2021; Oliveira 2020; Stefoni and Corvalán 2019; Wierna 2021). Despite similarities in migrant children's behaviour, host country policies differ. While education systems for migrant children in Europe and South America are unstructured, education in Sabah has found a solution to reduce the number of children of undocumented migrant workers by providing access to education. CLCI is a government-to-government collaboration, and HCASS is a Malaysian NGO concerned with the education of migrant children. Both organisations have different recruitment systems, curriculum, and outcomes but still make good contributions. However, an agreement is needed to reach a win-win solution for the benefit of the future of migrant children in Sabah.

CONCLUSION

It can be concluded that, academically, this research explains the process of dual educational practices among Indonesian migrant children in Sandakan, Sabah, Malaysia. The dual education practices provided by CLCI and HCASS display transnational interactions in providing access to education. The main contribution of this research can be seen from two aspects. Firstly, it shows transnational life in learning practices with two different systems. The behaviour of CLCI and HCASS teachers conducting teaching programmes according to their ways makes students receive very different learning systems. Access to education from CLCs can make their country an identity reference to strengthen individuals' commitment to their country. Access to education from HCASS can strengthen the association in students' transnational life, even though they often do "code-switching" behaviour unconsciously. Secondly, the dual education practice found in this study is a way to provide basic education for migrant children who do not have access to education. The education system from CLCI and HCASS is expected to emphasise the interests of the child's future. The role of parents is still lacking in improving academic skills; however, migrant families and communities play a big role in instilling a sense of national identity in their children. Children learn their Indonesian dialect at home. They are also exposed to cultural learning within the family and community. Therefore, there is a need for more collaboration between CLCI teachers, HCASS teachers and parents to encourage motivation to learn and, at the same time, instil the importance of education so that they are motivated to continue their studies in Indonesia or work in Malaysia with official documents.

Transnational life experiences in education for migrant children play an important role in the child's future and diplomatic relations between countries. Thus, practically, this research recommends the governments of Indonesia, Malaysia and the HCASS to further cooperation, especially equalising perceptions about the education system provided to children of migrant workers in Sabah so that the programme from the Indonesian government to repatriate migrant children to continue their education in Indonesia continues to run. HCASS, with minor adjustments, can still provide access to education for all migrant children. With education, each student will add "selling points" in interacting with the international community. Migrant children will be valued as increasingly modern society's potential, performing, mobile professionals. Continuous improvement in the education access programme for migrant children in Sabah should be one of the main agendas in the bilateral relationship between the governments of Indonesia and Malaysia.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research is part of an educational scholarship (Beasiswa Unggulan) funded by the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia (1644/J5.2.2/BP/PKS/2020).

REFERENCES

- Aarsaether, F. 2021. Learning environment and social inclusion for newly arrived migrant children placed in separate programmes in elementary schools in Norway. *Cogent Education* 8(1): 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2021.1932227>
- Amir Shah Noor Ahmad. 2019. Keselamatan insan dan akses pendidikan kanak-kanak warga Indonesia di Sabah. *Jurnal Borneo Arkhailogia* 4(1): 141–159.
- Abdul Hamid Jaafar, Norlida Hanim Mohd Salleh and Zulkifli Abdul Manaf. 2015. Intersectoral linkages in oil palm industry between Malaysia and Indonesia. *Jurnal Ekonomi Malaysia* 49(1): 25–36. <https://doi.org/10.17576/JEM-2015-4901-03>
- Ahmad Fauzi Abdul Hamid and Mohd Hariszuan Jaharudin. 2018. Social transformation, national identity and education policies in Malaysia. *Southeast Asian Social Science Review* 3(1): 53–85.
- Allerton, C. 2020. Invisible children? Non-recognition, humanitarian blindness and other forms of ignorance in Sabah, Malaysia. *Critique of Anthropology* 40(4): 455–470. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0308275X20959435>
- Andika Wahab and Ramli Dollah. 2022. Child labor and unfree labor: Evidence from the palm oil sector in Sabah (East Malaysia). *Journal of Human Rights* 22(3): 351–366. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14754835.2022.2115289>

- Andreouli, E. and C. Howarth. 2013. National identity, citizenship and immigration: Putting identity in context. *Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour* 43(3): 361–382. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-5914.2012.00501.x>
- Baltazar, M.A.K., A.U. Abubakar and W.S.W. Hassan. 2019. Children at-risk of statelessness and their constraints to citizenship. Working Paper SHAPE SEA Research Project.
- Biasutti, M. and E. Concina. 2021. Including migrant students in the primary school: Perspectives of Italian principals. *International Journal of Educational Management* 35(5): 984–999. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-01-2021-0028>
- Biasutti, M., E. Concina and S. Frate. 2020. Working in the classroom with migrant and refugee students: The practices and needs of Italian primary and middle school teachers. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society* 28(1): 113–129. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14681366.2019.1611626>
- Boldermo, S. and E. Ødegaard. 2019. What about the migrant children? The state-of-the-art in research claiming social sustainability. *Sustainability* 11(2): 459. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su11020459>
- Borden, J. 2016. Effects of national identity in transnational crises: Implications of social identity theory for attribution and crisis communications. *International Journal of Communication* 10(1): 377–397.
- Breton, C. 2015. Making national identity salient: Impact on attitudes toward immigration and multiculturalism. *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 48(2): 357–381. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0008423915000268>
- Byrne, J. 2018. National identity and migration in an emerging gateway community. *Social Sciences* 7(5): 73. <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci7050073>
- Cheong, A.R. 2022. Deportable to nowhere: Stateless children as challenges to state logics of immigration control. *Positions* 30(2): 245–275. <https://doi.org/10.1215/10679847-9573331>
- Clark, M.A. and J. Pietsch. 2014. *Indonesia-Malaysia relations: Cultural heritage, politics and labour migration*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Denzin, N.K. and Y.S. Lincoln. 2018. *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research*. 5th ed. California: SAGE Publications.
- Devine, D. 2013. ‘Value’ing children differently? Migrant children in education. *Children & Society* 27(4): 282–294. <https://doi.org/10.1111/chso.12034>
- Diliawan, R. and A.Y.S. Rahayu. 2018. Collaborative governance in fulfilling right of basic education of Indonesian migrant workers’ children in East Malaysia. Paper presented at 2nd International Conference on Administrative Science, Policy, and Governance Studies 2018 (ICAS-PGS 2018).
- Dong, J. 2020. Global learning from the periphery: An ethnographic study of a Chinese urban migrant school. *Sustainability* 12(1): 381. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su12010381>
- Farouk, A.F.A. and A. Husin. 2015. Development and social capital: A case study of selected Malaysian non-governmental organizations (NGOs). *Kajian Malaysia* 33(2): 25–42.

- Flemming, K. and J. Noyes. 2021. Qualitative evidence synthesis: Where are we at? *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 20: 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406921993276>
- Gromova, C., R. Khairutdinova, D. Birman and A. Kalimullin. 2021. Educational practices for immigrant children in elementary schools in Russia. *Education Sciences* 11(7): 325. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci11070325>
- Ha, S.E. and S.J. Jang. 2015. Immigration, threat perception, and national identity: Evidence from South Korea. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 44: 53–62. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijintrel.2014.12.001>
- Heldal, M., T.L. Hagen, I.O. Olaussen, G. Mette, D. Haugen, E.E. Ødegaard and S. Boldermo. 2021. Social sustainable education in a refugee camp. *Sustainability* 13(3925): 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13073925>
- Humana. 2018. HCASS facts and figures 2018. <https://www.humanaedu.com/hcass-facts-figures-2018> (accessed 10 March 2021).
- Ibrahim, M. and I.P. Alagidede. 2020. NGOs activities and local government spending in upper west region of Ghana: Are they complements or substitutes? *International Review of Philanthropy and Social Investment* 1(1): 73–86. <https://doi.org/10.47019/IRPSI.2020/v1n1a6>
- Juang, L.P. and M.K. Schachner. 2020. Cultural diversity, migration and education. *International Journal of Psychology* 55(5): 695–701. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ijop.12702>
- Lasimbang, H.B., W.T. Tong and W.Y. Low. 2016. Migrant workers in Sabah, East Malaysia: The importance of legislation and policy to uphold equity on sexual and reproductive health and rights. *Best Practice & Research Clinical Obstetrics & Gynaecology* 32: 113–123. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bpobgyn.2015.08.015>
- Lee, C. 2020. Negotiating dual identities: A case study on the narratives of two Myanmar refugee youths living in Malaysia. *Kajian Malaysia* 38(2): 61–89. <https://doi.org/10.21315/km2020.38.2.3>
- Liew, J. 2019. Homegrown statelessness in Malaysia: The administratively stateless and the promise of the principle of genuine and effective links. *Statelessness & Citizenship Review* 1(1): 95–135. <https://doi.org/10.35715/scr1001.115>
- Loganathan, T., Z.X. Chan, F. Hassan, Z.L. Ong and H.A. Majid. 2022. Undocumented: An examination of legal identity and education provision for children in Malaysia. *PLOS ONE* 17: e0263404. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0263404>
- Low, C.C. 2017. A strategy of attrition through enforcement: The unmaking of irregular migration in Malaysia. *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs* 36(2): 101–136.
- Lumayag, L.A. 2016. A question of access: Education needs of undocumented children in Malaysia. *Asian Studies Review* 40(2): 192–210. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10357823.2016.1158238>
- Lydia, F., K.V. Palanisamy, D. Mogana and L. Carynne. 2018. Private sector early child care and education in Malaysia: Workforce readiness for further education. *Kajian Malaysia* 36(1): 127–154. <https://doi.org/10.21315/km2018.36.1.6>
- Mangum, M. and R. Block. 2018. Social identity theory and public opinion towards immigration. *Social Sciences* 7(3). <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci7030041>

- Nesadurai, H.E.S. 2019. Transnational private governance as a developmental driver in Southeast Asia: The case of sustainable palm oil standards in Indonesia and Malaysia. *Journal of Development Studies* 55(9): 1892–1908. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2018.1536262>
- Neubauer, B.E., C.T. Witkop and L. Varpio. 2019. How phenomenology can help us learn from the experiences of others. *Perspect Med Educ* 8: 90–97. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40037-019-0509-2>
- Norhayati Zakaria and Nursakirah Ab Rahman Muton. 2022. Cultural code-switching in high context global virtual team members: A qualitative study. *International Journal of Cross Cultural Management* 22(3): 487–515. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14705958221137256>
- Nygård, O. 2021. Pre-migration status, social capital, and the educational aspirations of children of immigrants in disadvantaged Swedish schools. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research* 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00313831.2021.1897878>
- Oliveira, G. 2020. Transnational care constellations and education: Im/migrant children's family ties across borders. *Educação & Realidade* 45(2): 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1590/2175-623699891>
- Parker, E.C. 2014. The process of social identity development in adolescent high school choral singers: A grounded theory. *Journal of Research in Music Education* 62(1): 18–32. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022429413520009>
- Paschero, S. and J. McBrien. 2021. National identity and integration challenges of Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) recipients. *Recipients* 11(24): 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.3390/soc11010024>
- Poulija, S. and M. Jarec. 2021. Transnational lives: An anthropological approach to the negotiation of national identity. *Studia Ethnologica Croatica* 33: 203–225. <https://doi.org/10.17234/SEC.33.9>
- Puder, J. 2019. Excluding migrant labor from the Malaysian bioeconomy: Working and living conditions of migrant workers in the palm oil sector in Sabah. *Austrian Journal of South-East Asian Studies* 12(1): 31–48. <https://doi.org/10.14764/10.ASEAS-0012>
- Rahimah Abdul Aziz and Suriati Iskandar. 2013. Working children and knowledge of right to education: A study of child labour in Sabah, Malaysia. *Asian Social Science* 9(8): 23–33. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v9n8p23>
- Razali, R.M., R.N. Tamara and J. Duraisingam. 2015. Migration and statelessness: Turning the spotlight on Malaysia. *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* 23: 19–36.
- Saqib, Z., S. Ishfaq, F. Bilal and A. Mashood. 2015. Analysis of primary education at NGOs, private and public schools in Muzaffarabad. *International Journal of New Trends in Arts, Sports & Science Education* 4(2): 9–23.
- Schahbasi, A., S. Huber and M. Fieder. 2021. Factors affecting attitudes toward migrants: An evolutionary approach. *American Journal of Human Biology* 33(1): 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ajhb.23435>
- Shiohata, M. 2012. Improving educational access and quality for all children? Reimagining the role of an international NGO in Nepal. *Open Society PERI Conference*: 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.13140/RG.2.1.4766.3209>

- Stefoni, C. and J. Corvalán. 2019. The state of the art on the insertion of migrant children in the Chilean school system. *Estudios Pedagógicos XLV* 3: 201–215. <https://doi.org/10.4067/S0718-07052019000300201>
- Tajfel, H. and J.C. Turner. 1979. An integrative theory of intergroup conflict. In *Personality, roles, and social behavior*, eds. W. Ickes and E. Knowles, 199–218. New York: Springer-Verlag.
- _____. 2004. The social identity theory of intergroup behavior. In *Political psychology: Key readings*. New York, US: Psychology Press. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203505984-16>
- Tirado, P.C. and M. Del Olmo. 2019. Dilemmas and tensions teachers face with migrant students. *Disparidades* 74(1): 2659–6881. <https://doi.org/10.3989/dra.2019.01.007>
- Trepte, S. and L.S. Loy. 2017. Social identity theory and self-categorization theory. In *The International Encyclopedia of Media Effects* 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118783764.wbieme0088>
- Turner, J.C. 1975. Social comparison and social identity: Some prospects for intergroup behaviour. *European Journal of Social Psychology* 5(1): 1–34. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ejsp.2420050102>
- United Nations. 2015. *Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR)*. <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/universal-declaration-of-human-rights> (accessed 18 March 2022).
- Vertovec, S. 2001. Transnationalism and identity. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 27(4): 573–582. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183012009038>
- Wierna, C. de los Á.A. 2021. Migration and education: Access to education gaps against migrant children in Argentina. *Población & Sociedad* 28(1): 4–31. <https://doi.org/10.19137/pys-2021-280102>
- Williams, H. 2021. The meaning of “phenomenology”: Qualitative and philosophical the meaning phenomenological research. *The Qualitative Report* 26(2): 366–385. <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2021.4587>
- Wong, B.K.M. and Ghazali Musa 2020. Transnational behaviour among Malaysia My Second Home (MM2H) participants in Malaysia: An exploratory study. *Kajian Malaysia* 38(1): 19–45. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.21315/km2020.38.1.2>